Public Statement of Library Copyright Specialists: Fair Use & Emergency Remote Teaching & Research

Share this page: https://tinyurl.com/tvnty3a

March 13, 2020

This *Statement* is meant to provide clarity for U.S. colleges and universities about how copyright law applies to the many facets of remote teaching and research in the wake of the COVID-19 outbreak. We write this as copyright specialists at colleges, universities, and other organizations supporting higher education in the U.S. and Canada who work every day with faculty, staff, and librarians to enable them to make ethical and legal choices about copyright issues in online teaching.

The United States is in a time of crisis. As of this writing, more than 200 universities and colleges have moved to remote teaching. These moves aim to promote public health by slowing the spread of the disease, while maintaining at least some of the important functions higher education plays in teaching, learning, and research. We have heard concerns that copyright may pose impediments to a rapid shift to remote instruction, or conversely, that copyright is not relevant. While legal obligations do not automatically dissolve in the face of a public health crisis, U.S. copyright law is, thankfully, well equipped to provide the flexibility necessary for the vast majority of remote learning needed at this time.

Fair Use

Copyright law in the United States is made to support teaching, research, and learning. This stems from its Constitutional purpose, which is "to promote the Progress of Science and the useful Arts." One critical feature of copyright law is fair use,² a flexible users' right that allows the use of copyrighted works without permission. It accommodates a wide variety of circumstances, including new and rapidly evolving situations. In the words of one of our colleagues, April Hathcock, "fair use is made for just these kinds of contingencies."

To analyze whether a particular use is fair, courts balance four factors. The "heart of the fair use inquiry" lies in the first factor – the purpose and character of the use.³ Courts favor uses where the purpose is to benefit the public, even when that benefit is not "direct or tangible."⁴

¹ U.S. Const. art. I, § 8, cl. 8.

² 17 U.S.C. § 107

³ Blanch v. Koons, 467 F.3d 244, 251 (2d Cir. 2006)

⁴ Sega Enterprises Ltd. v. Accolade, Inc., 977 F.2d 1510, 1523 (9th Cir. 1992), as amended (Jan. 6, 1993)

Even under normal circumstances, courts favor educational uses because of their broad public benefits. While there are no fair use cases squarely addressing copying to help minimize a public health crisis, the other wide variety of public benefits cited by courts leads us to believe that this purpose would weigh extremely heavily in favor of fair use. For example, in the *Authors Guild v. HathiTrust* case, the court made it clear that providing access to persons with disabilities was a strong public interest that weighed heavily in the fair use assessment. Similarly, other courts have found that allowing reproduction of the Zapruder film documenting Kennedy's assassination was in the public interest, and allowing redistribution of leaked internal memos about problems with electronic voting machines also favored fair use.

The benefit to the public in providing remote coursework is obvious when it enables teaching to continue in the face of social distancing measures or quarantine, or when access to physical library materials is impossible. The public benefit of these measures is without a doubt of at least equal importance as in these cases.

The second factor examines the nature of the work used—is it more factual or creative, published or not? In cases like this, the second factor "has rarely played a significant role in the determination of a fair use dispute." For remote teaching in the COVID-19 situation, the analysis should be the same.

The third fair use factor examines the "amount and substantiality" of the work used. Per the Supreme Court, this is a flexible standard that is situation-specific. The third factor is not a mechanical application of a rule such as "no more than 10%" or "1 chapter." The question is whether "the quantity and value of the materials used ... are reasonable in relation to the purpose of the copying." For copies made to support rapid adoption of remote teaching, users should be thoughtful about this factor, but not agonize over it: a use can be fair as long as it reproduces what is reasonable to serve the purpose.

The fourth factor is "the effect of the use upon the potential market for or value of the copyrighted work." This factor "requires a balancing of the benefit the public will derive if the use is permitted" versus "the personal gain the copyright owner will receive if the use is denied." While in normal circumstances there may be licensing markets for some items, the spontaneity of a move to remote teaching under emergency circumstances reduces the importance of this factor. Checking for and relying on licensed alternatives bolsters the case for fair use under the fourth factor, but lack of time to check for licenses should not be a barrier to meeting the needs of our communities.

⁵ Cambridge Univ. Press v. Albert, 906 F.3d 1290 (11th Cir. 2018)

⁶ Authors Guild v. Google, Inc., 804 F.3d 202 (2d Cir. 2015)

⁷ Time Inc. v. Bernard Geis Assocs., 293 F. Supp. 130 (S.D.N.Y. 1968)

⁸ Online Policy Grp. v. Diebold, Inc., 337 F. Supp. 2d 1195 (N.D. Cal. 2004)

⁹ Authors Guild, 804 F.3d 202 (2d Cir. 2015)

¹⁰ Cambridge Univ. Press v. Becker, 863 F. Supp. 2d 1190 (N.D. Ga. 2012), rev'd sub nom. Cambridge Univ. Press v. Patton, 769 F.3d 1232 (11th Cir. 2014)

¹¹ Campbell v. Acuff-Rose Music, Inc., 510 U.S. 569 (1994)

¹² Bill Graham Archives v. Dorling Kindersley Ltd., 448 F.3d 605 (2d Cir. 2006).

Campuses can also consider approaches to mitigate potential risk.¹³ Campuses should restrict access to course materials only to students, instructors, or teaching assistants enrolled in the course. Further, they should provide content only for the period of time needed, and excerpt materials when pedagogically appropriate. This limits the possibility of market harm. Ultimately, the purpose of copyright law, "promot[ing] the Progress of Science and useful Arts," is served by engaging in these time-limited, purpose-specific uses.

It is evident that making materials available and accessible to students in this time of crisis will almost always be a fair use. As long as we are being thoughtful in our analysis and limiting our activities to the specific needs of our patrons during this time of crisis, copyright law supports our uses. The fair use doctrine accommodates the flexibility required by our shared public health crisis, enabling society to function and progress while protecting human life and safety.

We also encourage campuses to begin contemplating the longer-term needs this situation presents. While fair use is absolutely appropriate to support the heightened demands presented by this emergency, if time periods extend further, campuses will need to investigate and adopt solutions tailored for the long-term.

DMCA and Video

While fair use offers a clear path for most uses in rapidly shifting to remote teaching, some uses raise other concerns. In particular, copying a full-length movie or television episode from a DVD for use in teaching may require circumvention of technical protection measures, which is prohibited under the Digital Millennium Copyright Act ("DMCA"). Like fair use, the DMCA is designed with flexibility in mind—it empowers the Librarian of Congress to create exemptions allowing circumvention under certain circumstances. Unfortunately, the current exemptions extend only to copying "short portions" of motion pictures for use in certain types of teaching, not to copying entire works, even when doing so is clearly fair use. Courts disagree on whether circumvention violates the DMCA when the underlying use is non-infringing (for example, because of fair use) and on what constitutes circumvention. Individual institutions will need to make their own assessments of this issue in consultation with their legal counsel or administration.

When possible, we encourage using video through licensed services. From Netflix, Hulu, and Amazon Prime to PBS and cable channels, many films are readily available, either for free or after payment of a relatively low fee for access.

¹³ Authors Guild, 804 F.3d 202 (2d Cir. 2015)

¹⁴ 17 USC §1201

¹⁵ 34 CFR § 201.40(b)(1)(ii)(A)

¹⁶ See <u>Chamberlain v. Skylink</u>, 381 F.3d 1178 (Fed. Cir. 2004); <u>MDY v. Blizzard</u>, 629 F.3d 928 (9th Cir. 2010); <u>Universal Studios</u>, <u>Inc. v. Corley</u>, 273 F.3d 429 (2d Cir. 2001).

Rightsholders

Some creators and other copyright owners may find this analysis concerning. We offer this analysis from a place of deep respect for creators—and to provide a practical lens through which our colleagues working as instructors and in instructional support positions can keep copyright in mind despite the seismic changes they're implementing in support of public health.

We encourage the use of already-licensed online content, openly licensed, and public domain alternatives, and working with content vendors to find mutually agreed-on ways to expand existing access to support social distancing for instruction and research. We commend vendors who have stepped up to provide free access to certain resources through the end of the current academic term.¹⁷

See more Resources on Copyright & Emergency Remote Teaching & Research

Signatories

(Institutional affiliations listed for identification purposes only)

Emilie Algenio, Copyright/Fair Use Librarian, Texas A&M University Libraries Sara R. Benson, Copyright Librarian, University of Illinois at Urbana Champaign

Josh Bolick, Scholarly Communication Librarian, University of Kansas Libraries

Justin Lee Bonfiglio, Copyright Specialist, University of Michigan Library

Brandon Butler, Director of Information Policy, University of Virginia Library

Dwayne Buttler, University of Louisville

Will Cross, Director, Copyright & Digital Scholarship Center, North Carolina State University

Kyle K. Courtney, Copyright Advisor, Harvard Library

Kate Dickson, Copyright & Licensing Librarian, University of North Carolina, Charlotte

Amy V. Dygert, Director of Copyright Services, Cornell University

Will Edmiston, Librarian for Copyright & Reserves, The New School

Sandra Aya Enimil, Copyright Services Librarian, The Ohio State University

Ana Enriquez, Scholarly Communications Outreach Librarian, Penn State University

Maryam Fakouri, Copyright Librarian, University of Washington

Sharon E. Farb, Associate University Librarian and Chief Policy Strategist, UCLA

Donna L. Ferullo, Director, University Copyright Office, Purdue University

Katie Fortney, Copyright Policy & Education Officer, California Digital Library

Christine Fruin, Scholarly Communication and Digital Projects Manager, Atla

Agnes Gambill, Head of Scholarly Communications, Appalachian State University

Anne Gilliland, Scholarly Communications Officer, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Liz Hamilton, Copyright Librarian, Northwestern University Libraries and Northwestern University Press

¹⁷ Vendor Covid-19 Related Donations and Pro Bono Access

Kiowa Hammons, Rights Clearance Manager, The New York Public Library

Dave Hansen, Associate University Librarian & Lead Copyright and Information Policy Officer, Duke University

April M. Hathcock, Director of Scholarly Communications & Information Policy, New York University Brandy Karl, Head of the Office of Scholarly Communications and Copyright, Penn State University Molly Keener, Director of Digital Initiatives & Scholarly Communication, Wake Forest University

Mary Lee Kennedy, Executive Director, Association of Research Libraries

Matthew Kopel, Cornell University

Cindy Kristof, Head, Copyright & Scholarly Communication, Kent State University

Michael Maire Lange, Copyright & Information Policy Specialist, UC Berkeley

Melissa Levine, Director, UM Copyright Office, University of Michigan Library

Yuan Li, Scholarly Communications Librarian, Princeton University Library

Lisa A. Macklin, Associate Dean for Research, Engagement, and Scholarly Communications, Emory University Libraries

Peter Midgley, Director, Copyright Licensing Office, Brigham Young University

Carla Myers, Coordinator of Scholarly Communications, Miami University

Nazareth A. Pantaloni, III, Head, Copyright Program, Indiana University Libraries

Rina Elster Pantalony, Director, Copyright Advisory Services, Columbia University Libraries

Laura Quilter, Copyright and Information Policy, University of Massachusetts Amherst

Charlotte Roh, Scholarly Communications Librarian, University of San Francisco

Rachael Samberg, Scholarly Communication Officer & Program Director, UC Berkeley

LeEtta Schmidt, Copyright and Intellectual Property Librarian, University of South Florida

Nancy Sims, Copyright Program Librarian, University of Minnesota Libraries

Kevin L Smith, Dean of Libraries, University of Kansas

Stephen Spong, Law Library Director, Western University

Stephanie Towery, Copyright Officer, Texas State University

Nate Wise, Intellectual Property Office Manager, Brigham Young University - Idaho

Timothy Vollmer, Scholarly Communication & Copyright Librarian, UC Berkeley

Micah Zeller, Head of Scholarly Communication Services, Washington University in St. Louis

Katie Zimmerman, Director of Copyright Strategy, MIT Libraries

You can endorse this statement by filling out this form.

Endorsers

(Institutional affiliations listed for identification purposes only)

Andrew Kierig, Interim OER, Scholarly Communications, and Copyright Lead, George Mason University Libraries

Sarah McCleskey, Head of Resource & Collection Services, Hofstra

Anne E. McKee, Program Officer for Resource Sharing, Greater Western Library Alliance

Megan Gaffney, Coordinator, Interlibrary Loan and Document Delivery Services, University of Delaware

Harrison W. Inefuku, Scholarly Publishing Services Librarian, Iowa State University

Karen Estlund, Dean of Libraries, Colorado State University

Heather Joseph, Executive Director, SPARC

Karen Hines, Professor of Business, Berkshire Community College

Martin Kalfatovic, Associate Director, Smithsonian Libraries

Alexia Hudson-Ward, Azariah Smith Root Director of Libraries, Oberlin College and Conservatory

Nahali R. Croft, Digital Archivist, Georgia College

Perry Collins, Scholarly Communications Librarian, University of Florida

Kathleen DeLaurenti, Head Librarian, The Peabody Institute of Johns Hopkins University

Dennis Clark, Dean, University Libraries, University of Arkansas

Rachel Schnepper, Director of Academic Technology, Wesleyan University, CT, USA

Barbara Dewey, Dean of University Libraries and Scholarly Communications, The Pennsylvania State University

Howard Besser, Professor, New York University

Pia M. Hunter, Teaching Assistant Professor, University of Illinois College of Law

Samuel Trosow, Associate Professor, University of Western Ontario

Aaron W Dobbs, Scholarly Communication Librarian, Shippensburg University of Pennsylvania

Beth Williams, Senior Director, Robert Crown Law Library & Senior Lecturer in Law, Stanford Law School Anne Langley, Dean, UConn Library, University of Connecticut

Amanda Runyon, Associate Dean and Director, Biddle Law Library, University of Pennsylvania Carey Law School

Chris Bourg, Director of Libraries, MIT

Corey Seeman, Director, Kresge Library Services (Ross School of Business), University of Michigan

Lorelei Sterling, Head of Access Services, interim, University of Alaska Anchorage

Danielle M. Williams, Director of First-Year Writing, Baylor University

Sophie Forrester, User Experience and Technology Librarian, Lasell University

Amanda Watson, Director of the O'Quinn Law Library, Assistant Professor, University of Houston Law Center

Megan Donald, Interim Director, Mabee Legal Information Center, University of Tulsa College of Law

Abigail Phillips, Assistant Professor, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Billie Jo Kaufman, Interim Law Library Director & Visiting Professor of Law, Mercer University Law School Matthew Vest, Music Librarian , UCLA

Linda Dempf, Music and Media Librarian, The College of New Jersey

Hilary Seo, Interim Dean of Library Services, Iowa State University

Megan A. Brooks, Dean of Library Services, Wheaton College MA

Alexia Hudson-Ward, Azariah Smith Root Director of Libraries, Oberlin College and Conservatory

Michelle Oswell, Library Director, Curtis Institute of Music

Violeta Ilik, Head, Digital Collections and Preservation Systems, Columbia University

Joseph A. Salem, Jr., Dean of Libraries, Michigan State University

Maura Smale, Chief Librarian and Professor, NYC College of Technology, CUNY

R Sekhar Chivukula, Professor of Physics, UC San Diego

Kathryn Loomis, Teaching Fellow, University of North Texas

Christine Heron, Senior Librarian, Genesee District Library

Celia Rabinowitz, Dean of Mason Library, Keene State College

Carolyn S. Brodie, Professor Emeriti, Kent State University, School of Information

Heather Slania, Director, MICA's Decker Library, Maryland Institute College of Art

R. David Lankes, Professor and Director, School of Library and Information Science, University of South Carolina

Katie McNamara, Teacher Librarian, CSLA President, North High & Fresno Pacific University

Brad Warren, Associate Dean of Library Services, University of Cincinnati

Peace Ossom-Williamson, Director of Research Data Services, The University of Texas at Arlington

Courtney Selby, Associate Dean for Library Services and Associate Professor of Legal Research, St. John's University School of Law

Jonah McAllister-Erickson, Scholarly Communication Specialist, University of Pittsburgh

Katie Willeford, Learning Resources Librarian, University of Texas at Arlington

Jill Hurst-Wahl, Professor of Practice, Syracuse University

Shannon DeSantis Gile, School Librarian, Lamoille South Unified Union School District

Jen Waller, Director of Open Initiatives and Scholarly Communication, University of Oklahoma

Bryan M. Carson, Library Director (and copyright attorney), Missouri Valley College

Miriam Deutch, Associate Professor, Brooklyn College, City University of New York

Ada Emmett, librarian and director, Shulenburger Office of Scholarly Communication & Copyright, University of Kansas

Dorothy Meaney, Director, Tisch Library, Tufts University

David Scherer, Scholarly Communications and Research Curation Consultant, Carnegie Mellon University

Sue Ann Gardner, Scholarly Communications Librarian, University of Nebraska-Lincoln

Paul Royster, Coordinator of Scholarly Communication , University of Nebraska-Lincoln

Donna Reed, Ph.D., Dean of Library and Learning Resources, City College of San Francisco

Anne M. Young, Director of Legal Affairs and Intellectual Property, Newfields

Colleen Lyon, Head of Scholarly Communications, UT Austin

Inga H. Barnello, Director of the Library, Le Moyne College

Kristen M. Burkholder, Access Services Librarian & Associate Professor, Oklahoma City University Stephanie Davis-Kahl, Collections & Scholarly Communication Librarian, Illinois Wesleyan University Robin N Sinn, Coordinator, Office of Scholarly Communication, Sheridan Libraries, Johns Hopkins University

Fruma Mohrer, (former) Chief Archivist, I endorse use of copyrighted items for long distance classroom learning during virus crisis, Yivo Institute for Jewish Research (former)

Christin, Wixson, Scholarly Communication Librarian, Plymouth State University

Nicoladie Tam, Associate Professor, University of North Texas

Amanda Page, Digital Curation Librarian, Hamilton College

Karen Bleier, Collection Mgmt & Resource Sharing Librarian, Park University

Amy Hoseth, Assistant Dean, Colorado State University Libraries

Sue Kunda, Scholarly Communications and Social Science Librarian, Western Oregon University

Steven D. Hinckley, Associate Dean for Library and Information Services, Penn State Law/Penn State University

Heather Soyka, Assistant Professor, Kent State University iSchool

Jennie Rose Halperin, Assistant Director for Outreach and Community Engagement, Harvard Law School Library

Megan Wacha, Scholarly Communications Librarian, City University of New York

Nora Allred, Assistant Director for Scholarly Communications, Michigan Technological University

Elizabeth Berney, Content & Delivery Services Librarian, Northern Arizona University

Marcia Keyser, Online Graduate Support Librarian, Drake University

Ryan Otto, Scholarly Communication Librarian, Kansas State University

Lauren Ginsberg DeVilbiss, Librarian, NYC Dept of Education

Deborah L. Heller, Acting Director of the Law Library, Elisabeth Haub School of Law at Pace University

Steve Oberg, Group Leader for Research Description and Digital Initiatives, Wheaton College (IL)

Rachel Bridgewater, Reference, Instruction, and Copyright Librarian, Portland Community College

Hao Zeng, Head of Library Web and Digital Services, Yeshiva University

Leila Belle Sterman, Scholarly Communication Librarian, Montana State University

Georgia Westbrook, OER & Instruction Librarian, Touro College

Alex R. Hodges, Director, Gutman Library, Harvard Graduate School of Education

Jennifer L. Pate, Scholarly Communications and Instructional Services Librarian, University of North Alabama

Maurine McCourry, Library Director, Hillsdale College

Lindsey Weeramuni, Intellectual Property Manager, MIT Office of Digital Learning

Paul Scott Lapinski, Associate Director, Scholarly Communication & Open Science, Harvard Medical School

John O'Connor, Scholarly Communications Librarian, Boston College

Martin J. Brennan, Scholarly Communication Education Librarian, UCLA Library

Susan LaGatta, School Library Media Specialist, Mary E. Roberts Elementary School

Julia Simic, Assistant Head of Digital Scholarship Services, Digital Production and Preservation, University of Oregon

Elsa Loftis, Humanities and Acquisitions Librarian, Portland State University

Ann Buehl, District Library Media Director, Parkview School District

Kristen Hoffman, Psychology and Scholarly Communications Librarian, Seattle Pacific University

Larry Harkcom, Distance Education Librarian, Southwestern College

Millie Gonzalez, Digital Services Librarian, Framingham State University

Rick Davis, Copyright & Scholarly Communications Librarian, Towson University

University Library Faculty Council, California State University Long Beach

Jay Starratt, Dean of Libraries, Washington State University

Anne Marie Doyle, School librarian, Dunn's corners elementary school

Hillary Miller, Scholarly Communications Librarian, Virginia Commonwealth University

Andrew Ashton, Director of the Libraries, Vassar College

John Edward Martin, Scholarly Communication Librarian, University of North Texas

Gregory Lum, Library Director, Clark Library of Jesuit High School, Portland, OR

Lisa Macklem, PhD Candidate, University of Western Ontario

Nicholas Netzel, Librarian, Central Catholic High School, Portland, OR

Carrie A. L. Nelson, Director of Scholarly Communication, University of Wisconsin-Madison

Jessica Lorentz Smith, Teacher Librarian, Bend Senior High School

Frederick D. Barnhart, Dean of University Libraries, Northern Illinois University

Jennifer Beamer, Scholarly Communication Librarian (Coordinator), The Claremont Colleges Library

James M. Darlack, Director of Goddard Library, Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary

Allegra Swift, Scholarly Communications Librarian, UC San Diego

Michelle Speed, Librarian, North Central Texas College, Corinth Campus Library

Jennifer Chan, Scholarly Communication Librarian, UCLA

Joshua Zeller, Access Services Coordinator, Mount St. Joseph University

Julie Patricia, Associate Librarian, Ada Community Library

Chris Freeland, Director of Open Libraries, Internet Archive

Melissa H. Cantrell, Scholarly Communication Librarian, University of Colorado Boulder

Andrea Wirth, Scholarly Communication Librarian, University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Kristine Alpi, University Librarian, Oregon Health & Sciences University

Michaela Willi Hooper, OER & Textbook Affordability Librarian, Linn-Benton Community College

Mark G. Bilby, Scholarly Communications Librarian, California State University, Fullerton

Anne Shelley, Scholarly Communication Librarian, Illinois State University

Andrew Bonamici, University Librarian, Drew University, Madison, New Jersey

Daniel Chamberlain, Associate Librarian for Digital Strategies, Dartmouth Library

Anita Coleman, Director of Library Services and Professor of Bibliography and Research, Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary

Lindsey Gumb, Scholarly Communications Librarian, Roger Williams University
Patrick Carr, Program Manager for Library Consortium Operations, Connecticut State Colleges &
Universities

Patrick Carr	Program Manager for Library Consortium Operations	Connecticut State Colleges & Universities
Tracey E Mendoza	Dean of Libraries	University of the Incarnate Word